Bullying & harassment in the training environment

Dr Matthew Clarke
Histopathology Clinical Fellow, Institute of Cancer Research
RCPath Chair of Trainees Advisory Committee (TAC)
Today’s talk…

- Background to this issue
- Extent of the problem in medicine
- The impact of bullying and undermining
- What measures can we take to tackle it
Ingrained in the culture of medicine and science for many years
Can affect all members of staff, irrespective of seniority
Significant impact on an individual/team cannot be underestimated
Not a new problem, but we are now becoming more vigilant

Bullying and harassment is completely unacceptable and has absolutely no place in pathology
Bullying & Harassment; background

- Bullying and harassment can take many different forms
- Those affected are more likely to make mistakes
- Those affected less likely to raise concerns about patient safety
- Can result in absenteeism
- Humiliation sometimes considered an acceptable part of training

**Serious consequences for mental and physical health**
Reasons for bullying and undermining

- Current changes in the NHS
- Increased pressure on managers and staff
- Financial pressures
- Needing to achieve competitive results
What is bullying?

• Bullying and harassment can take many different forms
  – verbal, physical, written, social media etc.

• Range of different negative behaviours:
  - excessive monitoring of work, social exclusion, humiliation, persistent criticism

• Power imbalance

• Perceptions and subjective view
Who are the targets?

- Neuroticism (sensitive, low emotional stability)
- Extraversion (energetic, sociable)
- Agreeableness (kind, friendly)
- Openness (curious, intellectual)
- Conscientious (organised, dependable)
Who are the targets?

- Neuroticism (sensitive, low emotional stability) \( \uparrow \)
- Extraversion (energetic, sociable) \( \downarrow \rightarrow \)
- Agreeableness (kind, friendly) \( \downarrow \rightarrow \)
- Openness (curious, intellectual) \( \uparrow \downarrow \)
- Conscientious (organised, dependable) \( \uparrow \downarrow \rightarrow \)

- *Not a homogenous group*
- *Female gender often over-represented*
Who are the perpetrators?

- Increased neuroticism
- Protecting self-esteem
- Differences in self-esteem
- Lack of appropriate social skills and communication
- Lack of self-reflection and insight
- Most frequently associated with ‘managers’
- Most frequently male gender
Preceding factors: social

- Social interactions
- Socialisation
- Learned behavior and norms
- Outgroup denigration
- Reciprocity
Preceding factors: social

- Previous encounters
- Perseverance
- Justice
- Calculated bullying
- Displaced aggression
Preceding factors: organisation

- Culture and climate
- Lack of discipline
- Change
- Leadership
- Organisation and design of job
- Physical environment
Consequences for the target

- Impact on psychological health
- Substance abuse
- Physical health
- Family life
Consequences for bystanders

- Consider leaving job
- Feeling unsafe in role
- Similar impacts on psychological/physical health compared to targets
Consequences for organisations

• Absences from work
• Increased staff turnover
• Impact on job satisfaction
• Financial costs to the organisation
• Significant impact on patient care
GMC Standards

• ‘Promoting excellence: standards for medical education and training’
• Regulations for the treatment of those in training
• Requirement R3.3:
  - Learners must not be subjected to, or subject others to, behavior that undermines their professional confidence, performance or self-esteem
• Victims of bullying 10% more likely to leave training in 1 year
GMC Trainee Survey 2017

- Significant overall findings:

  - 0.4% (187) trainee doctors reported that they had been a victim or witness of bullying and harassment and were prepared to report it

  - 5.1% (2721) were either a victim or a witness but were not prepared to report it

  - NHS Staff Survey – 24.3% (250,000 staff)
GMC 2017 Trainee Survey

• The results in the major specialties:
  - *Medicine:* 69 vs 808
  - *Surgery:* 23 vs 643
  - *O&G:* 26 vs 290

• Significant concerns regarding trainees not reporting these incidents
## GMC 2017 Trainee Survey: perpetrators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Person doing the bullying or undermining</th>
<th>Number of responses in national training surveys 2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consultant/GP (within my post)</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultant/GP (outside my post)</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse/midwife</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other doctor</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other trainee</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient/relative</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Most frequent perpetrators are consultants or those in senior posts*
### GMC 2017 Trainee Survey: type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of bullying/undermining</th>
<th>Number of responses in national training surveys 2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belittling or humiliation</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threatening or insulting behaviour</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deliberately preventing access to training</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bullying related to protected characteristics</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Most frequent form is belittling or humiliation*
### Reason for not reporting bullying and undermining via the national training surveys

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Number of responses in national training survey 2017*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The issue has already been resolved locally</td>
<td>753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have raised it, or intend to raise the issue locally</td>
<td>752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don’t think the issue is serious enough to report</td>
<td>613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don’t think reporting will make a difference</td>
<td>944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of adverse consequences</td>
<td>852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most non-reporters think that reporting the problem will not make a difference
Bullying & Harassment

• 2017 GMC trainee survey
  – 31 reported occurrences in pathology

• Not as many as other specialties (>600 in surgery)

• No one prepared to provide additional details about incidents

• Many factors contributing to this reluctance

*Just one incident of bullying and harassment is too many*
Significant overall findings:

- **5.8% (2972)** trainee doctors reported that they had been a victim or witness of bullying and harassment and were prepared to report it.

- **5.4% (2784)** were either a victim or a witness but were not prepared to report it.

GMC Trainee Survey 2018
### GMC Trainee Survey 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I don’t think reporting will make a difference</td>
<td>24.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of adverse consequences</td>
<td>21.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have raised it, or intend to raise the issue locally instead</td>
<td>16.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The issue has already been resolved locally</td>
<td>16.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don’t think the issue is serious enough to report</td>
<td>15.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## GMC Trainee Survey 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Who has been doing the undermining/bullying described in your concern?</th>
<th>Which behaviour types describe your concern?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consultant/GP (within my post)</td>
<td>Belittling or humiliation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse/Midwife</td>
<td>Threatening or insulting behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other doctor</td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>Bullying related to a protected characteristic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Deliberately preventing access to training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultant/GP (outside my post)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other trainee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient/relative</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bullying & Harassment: what can we do?

- The GMC has stated that the following are key factors contributing to a positive and supportive training environment:
  - Valuing doctors in training
  - Departmental cohesion & leadership
  - Managing workload & stress for doctors in training & consultants
  - Communication with doctors in training; recognising undermining
  - The need for effective senior leadership

Consideration of these factors is paramount to successfully tackling bullying and harassment
O&G: Bullying and Undermining Toolkit

• Strategic interventions
  – Measures that over-arching organisations such as the NHS, GMC and medical royal colleges can implement

• Unit, trust and local education provider interventions
  – Measures that whole trusts or hospitals can implement

• Departmental and team interventions
  – Measures that individual teams within a hospital can implement

• Individual interventions
  – Measures that can be implemented at an individual level, whether victim, perpetrator or manager of affected individuals
RCS(Ed): #LetsRemoveit

- Created by a working group of RCS(Ed) with aims of:
  - Create a clear evidence base of the impact that bullying has on patient outcomes and disseminate this widely
  - Develop resources and host events
  - Ensure RCSEd prioritises anti-bullying activities
  - Work in partnership
Bystander Training

• There are many things that bystanders to bullying can do to become upstanders:

- **Question the bullying behaviour.** Changing the subject or questioning the behaviour can shift the focus

- **Use humour to redirect the conversation**

- **Bystanders can intervene as a group to show there are several people who don’t agree with the bullying**

- **Reach out privately to check in with the person who was bullied to let them know you do not agree with it and that you care**
Bullying & Harassment: ACTIONS

- RCPath & Trainees Advisory Committee developed this strategy:
  - Endorsing the ‘Let’s Remove It’ campaign of the RCSEd
  - ‘Not in the Textbooks’ RCPath/TAC conference featuring this topic
  - Slide presentation used as a resource for College members & trainees to highlight the issue at relevant conferences and meetings
  - RCPath website featuring the College’s position and resources
  - The issue of bullying features in the Bulletin & as part of the College blog series.

Aiming to help all staff feel supported and show them where help is available should they need it
Uniting the specialties

• “Tackling Undermining and Bullying in the NHS”
• 4th April 2019
• One-day, interactive forum; learning about strategies that have been successfully adopted to manage difficult workplace behaviour issues
• The speakers had a range of experience from both within the NHS and in other sectors.
• Collaborative ventures which you could sign up to, and took part in interactive workshops to discuss strategies.
• Discuss own experiences with dealing with inappropriate behaviour, hear about successful ventures.

Forthcoming College Bulletin article!
Summary

- This is not a new problem that many have experienced
- Pathology is not excluded
- Requires a culture change to tackle it
- Measures are now being implemented by TAC and RCPath

• *One incident of bullying is too many*

• *Bullying and harassment has no place in pathology*
References and Resources

- General Medical Council, Training Environments 2017: Key findings from the national training surveys ([www.gmc-uk.org/~/media/documents/NTS_Report_20173](http://www.gmc-uk.org/~/media/documents/NTS_Report_20173))
- RCSEd Anti-Bullying and Undermining Campaign ([www.rcsed.ac.uk/professional-support-development-resources/anti-bullying-and-undermining-campaign](http://www.rcsed.ac.uk/professional-support-development-resources/anti-bullying-and-undermining-campaign))